MINUTE RECORD OF THE CITY OF SAN ANGELO DESIGN AND HISTORIC REVIEW COMMISSION MEETING SCHEDULED FOR THURSDAY, MARCH 17, 2016, AT 10:00 A.M, SOUTH MEETING ROOM, MCNEASE CONVENTION CENTER, 501 RIO CONCHO DRIVE, SAN ANGELO, TEXAS.

PRESENT: Ashley Young-Turner (Chair), David Mazur, Terry Hucks, William Carter,

Gary Donaldson

ABSENT: Sandra Morris (AE)

STAFF: Jon James, AICP – Planning and Development Services Director

Rebeca Guerra, AICP, LEED-AP, CPD - Planning Manager

Daniel Saluri – Deputy City Attorney Al Torres – Chief Building Official

Barbara Hesse – Historic Preservation Officer David Stallworth, AICP – Principal Planner

Jeff Fisher – Planner I

I. Call to order and establish that a quorum is present.

The meeting was called to order at 10:03 a.m. by Chairperson Young-Turner. A quorum of five (5) was present.

Consent Agenda:

The Commission may request for a Consent Agenda item to be moved to the Regular Agenda for presentation and public comment. Otherwise, the Consent Agenda will be considered in one vote.

a. Consideration of approving the February 18, 2016 Design & Historic Review Commission regular meeting minutes.

A Motion to approve the meeting minutes was made by Commissioner Hucks and seconded by Commissioner Carter. The Motion passed unanimously, 5-0.

II. Regular Agenda:

Chairperson Young-Turner opened the meeting by introducing the following two (2) items for tandem consideration, due to their associated nature:

a. <u>CA16-01: Pfluger</u> – A request for approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness,
 as required per Section 211.E of the Zoning Ordinance, for new construction

on a historical landmark site as follows: The erection of a new 96-square foot steel-framed, cloth canopy that will project over the public right-of-way along the Cactus Hotel building's south entrance and two (2) new metal wall sconce lights, one on each side of the canopy, located at the northwest corner of the intersection of East Twohig Avenue and South Oakes Street, on 0.393 acres.

b. RCC16-03: Pfluger – A request for approval, as required per Section 12.06.003(b)(1) of the River Corridor Development Ordinance, for the construction of a 96-square foot steel-framed, cloth canopy that will project over the public right-of-way along the Cactus Hotel building's south entrance and two (2) new metal wall sconce lights, one on each side of the canopy, located at the northwest corner of the intersection of East Twohig Avenue and South Oakes Street, on 0.393 acres.

Chairperson Young-Turner further clarified the nature and differences of both applications, as well as reasoning for hearing them simultaneously. Jeff Fisher, Planner, introduced himself and provided brief synopses of both cases. Mr. Fisher indicated the locations of the proposed canopy and exterior lighting, elaborated on design and color details of the proposed canopy, provided the historical context behind the proposed canopy's color and design as well as the selection of wall sconces, and showed various perspectives of the surrounding area. Mr. Fisher concluded his presentation with the following:

- a recommendation to APPROVE the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for new construction on a Historic Landmark, subject to two (2) Conditions of Approval; and
- a recommendation to APPROVE the request to construct a canopy that will project over the public right-of-way along the Cactus Hotel building's south entrance and two (2) new metal wall sconce lights, subject to three (3) Conditions of Approval, along with his bases for both recommendations.

Chairperson Young-Turner opened the public hearing. Becca Kelly, representing the applicant, Lee Pfluger, approached the podium, introduced

herself and made herself available for questions. Commissioner Mazur inquired about the location of the proposed exterior lighting. Ms. Kelly indicated that the proposed sconces will be on either side of the entrance door to the basement floor and not underneath the proposed canopy, but rather off to the side. Commissioner Hucks expressed his support of the project. With no further public input waiting, Chairperson Young-Turner closed the public hearing and entertained Motions on case number CA16-01.

Commissioner Mazur made a Motion to APPROVE the request for Case CA16-01, a Certificate of Appropriateness, subject to the two (2) recommended Conditions, and Commissioner Donaldson seconded the Motion. The Motion passed unanimously, 5-0.

Commissioner Mazur made a Motion to APPROVE the request for Case RCC16-03, for the construction of a proposed canopy along with lighting, subject to the three (3) recommended Conditions, and Commissioner Hucks seconded the Motion. The Motion passed unanimously, 5-0.

c. <u>RCC16-05: Curtis Sign Co.</u> – A request for approval, as required by Section 12.06.003(e)(4) of the River Corridor Development Ordinance, for a new 12-square foot illuminated wall sign along the front building elevation of an existing restaurant and lounge, located along the north side of West Beauregard, between South Chadbourne Street and South Irving Street, on 0.218 acres.

David Stallworth, Principal Planner, introduced himself and provided a brief synopsis of the case. Mr. Stallworth indicated the project location, showed various perspectives of the surrounding area, and elaborated on details regarding the proposed signage. Mr. Stallworth concluded his presentation with a recommendation of APPROVAL, subject to three (3) Conditions, along with his basis for the recommendation.

Commissioner Mazur sought clarification of the proposed signage. Mr. Stallworth referred the Commission to slide number four (4), which indicated its location on a support column between both building entrances along the east facade. Chairperson Young-Turner sought further clarification on sign design and location; Mr. Stallworth referred the Commission to slide number three (3), which indicated that the new sign will be similar in design and location to the existing banner sign as currently set. Barring further questions for Staff, Chairperson Young-Turner opened the public hearing. Curtis Hensley, the applicant, approached the podium, introduced himself and made himself available for questions. Commissioner Mazur inquired about the choice of sign colors, and Chairperson Young-Turner followed up with an inquiry on sign illumination details. Mr. Hensley replied that the proposed sign will have black and gray lettering and logo on a white background and that the sign itself will be a backlit, 5-inch canister. With no further public input waiting, Chairperson Young-Turner closed the public hearing and entertained Motions.

Commissioner Carter made a Motion to APPROVE Case RCC16-05, and Commissioner Hucks seconded the Motion. The Motion passed unanimously, 5-0.

d. <u>RCC16-02</u>: <u>San Angelo Medical Center</u>: Discussion and possible action relating to Conditions of Approval from the February 18, 2016, DHRC decision for a 136-square foot freestanding sign, located along the east side of North Bryant Boulevard, south of the Houston Harte Expressway (U.S. 67), on 0.95 acres.

Rebeca Guerra, Planning Manager, introduced herself and provided details behind the request for discussion, to include a background of the case and details on the amended Conditions that were previously imposed. Ms. Guerra then introduced a landscape plan that was submitted to the Division to satisfy one of the required Conditions, as well as imagery of site conditions in relation

to the submitted landscape plan. It was demonstrated that the palm trees and xeriscape installed in accordance with the submitted Landscape Plan did not appear to conform to the Conditions imposed by the Commission. Ms. Guerra also introduced imagery of the surrounding area to offer perspective and to aid the Commission in determining compatibility and consistency with both the surrounding area and the River Corridor Master Development Plan (or RCMDP). Ms. Guerra summarized that the decision before the Commission at this meeting will be to either declare the proposed Landscape Plan and the current plantings inconsistent with the imposed Conditions of Approval, amend the Conditions to accommodate the submitted landscape plan and subsequent plantings accordingly, or amend the Conditions subject to reaching a suitable compromise with the applicant.

Commissioner Donaldson inquired on landscape "groupings" of trees as shown on Staff's exhibits; Ms. Guerra clarified the location and types of trees proposed on the Landscape Plan, the existing on-premise trees that were not impacted by the Conditions, and the new street trees already planted in relation to the proposed Landscape Plan. Commissioner Mazur inquired on existing trees toward the rear of the property; Ms. Guerra indicated that they were not affected by the Conditions of Approval or located within the River Corridor area. Chairperson Young-Turner elaborated on her previous discussions with City Council members regarding this matter, expressing that the Commission should set the tone for maintaining consistent and easy-to-follow standards for this particular case and other cases thereafter. Ms. Guerra reiterated what decisions are available to the Commission, noting that Staff rejected the applicant's proposed Landscape Plan and was now seeking direction from the Commissioner Hucks sought Commission as to how to move forward. clarification as to the tree selection and placement.

Matt Muehlstein, representative for San Angelo Community Medical Center, introduced himself and sought clarification from Commissioner Hucks as to the

nature of his inquiry. Mr. Muehlstein then proceeded to maintain that the subject property was not located within the River Corridor, but instead in the Sign Control jurisdiction, insisting that he did not do anything untowards by moving the trees from the property. Mr. Muehlstein further stated that he moved the trees so that people could notice the sign, noting that the sign was limited by the Commission to the pre-existing 136-square-foot sign area, and that any plantings covering his sign would render the sign ineffective. Commissioner Hucks responded that he understood the applicant's position, but that he expected to see landscaping that was less reliant on xeriscaping. Mr. Muehlstein responded by stating that the proposed xeriscape was for water conservation purposes and was best suited for this site while again noting that he was not in "the landscape jurisdiction." Commissioner Carter agreed with the applicant's reasoning, but expressed that his expectations did not take into account palm trees or other trees that were different from those which were removed. Mr. Muehlstein concluded that although there were area examples of xeriscaping in conjunction with larger canopy trees, these properties had signs that were larger and higher than the subject sign.

With no further public input, Chairperson Young-Turner closed the public hearing and opened the floor to further deliberation. Ms. Guerra expounded on possible compromise options for the benefit of the Commission's decision-making while reiterating what decision options were available to the Commission. Commissioners Donaldson and Mazur discussed the chain of events leading up to the tree removal in relation to the applicant's submittal; Ms. Guerra explained that the trees were on the premises at the time of application and were completely removed following the Commission's original February 18, 2016, decision. Commissioner Mazur later expressed his support of the xeriscaping.

Commissioner Mazur made a Motion to AMEND Condition of Approval number four (4) from the February 18, 2016, DHRC meeting to read: "On-

premise landscaping along North Bryant Boulevard shall be in accordance with the Landscape Plan submitted by the applicant on February 24, 2016." Commissioner Carter seconded the Motion. The Motion passed, 4-1, with Chairperson Young-Turner voting in dissent.

III. Director's Report.

Mr. James indicated that no report would be offered at this meeting.

VII. Future meeting agenda and announcements.

Chairperson Young-Turner announced that the next regular meeting of the Design and Historic Review Commission is scheduled to begin on <u>Thursday, April 21, 2016</u>, at 10:00 a.m. in Council Chambers (South Meeting Room) of the McNease Convention Center at 501 Rio Concho Drive.

VIII. Adjournment.

Commissioner Hucks made a Motion to adjourn the meeting, which was seconded by Commissioner Carter. The Motion passed unanimously, 5-0, and the meeting ended at 10:46 a.m.

Ashley Young-Turner, Chairperson
Design & Historic Review Commission